CHAPTER 20 / Comparing Points of View

You read in the text that although most people supported the Libby Dam project at first, some people soon came to recognize the negative environmental impact of the project. Below are two excerpts from material published in newspapers during the early days of the project. Read the two excerpts, and then answer the questions that follow.

"... Multipurpose Libby will be 'the best thing that has happened to western Montana since Hungry Horse Dam,' in the words of Sen. Mansfield. ... [T]he project will provide a peak employment of 1,925 workers and a peak payroll of \$13.3 million in 1969. ... Construction will require purchase of \$18.2 million worth of local material and supplies. ... Libby will add five million acre-feet to flood control storage. ... Initial installation will include four 105,000-kilowatt generators."

- Tobacco Valley News (Eureka), July 16, 1964

• • •

"Though the project will offer lake recreation, a tremendous stretch of natural river will be lost. . . . [R]eservoirs lack many of the desirable features found in most natural lakes. . . . The change in environment will be more suitable for scrap fish...than it will for trout. . . . Such projects have an effect on game animals as well. . . . [D]eer winter range will be flooded . . . mountain sheep winter range will be flooded, and there will be a great loss of waterfowl habitat."

> *— Western News (Libby),* remarks by Director of Montana Fish and Game Department, June 11, 1964

- (1) Which excerpt supports the Libby Dam project and which one is against it? How can you tell?
- (2) List some of the words and phrases that show support and concern for the project.
- (3) What are the priorities of the people who support the dam? What are the priorities of those who are against it?

Critical Thinking

Which excerpt do you think gives the stronger argument for its point of view about the Libby Dam project? Explain your answer.